



**APPROVED
SUMMARIZED MINUTES**

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

Thursday, February 21, 2019

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85251**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 5:15 p.m. Commissioner Higgs arrived after the start of the meeting.

2. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Barry Graham, Chair
Pamela Iacovo, Vice Chair
Don Anderson
George Ertel
Renee Higgs
Michael Kuzel
B. Kent Lall

STAFF: Paul Basha, Transportation Director
Frances Cookson, Staff Representative
Lisa Johnson, Transportation Planning and Transit Operations Manager

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

Chair invited public comments. There were none.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – January 17, 2019

Chair called for comments or changes. Commissioner provided a correction in terms of the mover/seconded of the minute approval from the previous meeting and a grammatical correction.

COMMISSIONER ERTEL MOVED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ON JANUARY 17 AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER ANDERSON SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 7-0 WITH CHAIR GRAHAM, VICE CHAIR IACOVO AND COMMISSIONERS ANDERSON, ERTEL, HIGGS, KUZEL AND LALL VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

5. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN MODIFICATIONS

Mr. Basha stated that the Transportation Department, Planning Department and Police Departments are recommending that 128th Street through the Preserve remain in the Transportation Master Plan. There was previously an inadvertent reference to its removal from the Transportation Master Plan. The Transportation Commission had extensive review and discussion on the Transportation Master Plan from January, 2015 through February, 2016. The City Council had a lengthy study session and a public hearing to adopt the recommendations. The action item for this meeting is a motion to recommend changes to the Transportation Master Plan. City Council will discuss the recommendations tentatively scheduled for a public hearing on April 2nd, 2019.

Mr. Basha reviewed recommended Transportation Master Plan amendments:

1. Include Lincoln Drive, west of Scottsdale Road, as a minor arterial.
2. Reclassify Hayden Road between Princess Boulevard and Legacy Drive, to a major arterial from its current classification as a minor arterial.
3. Extend Legacy Drive east from Hayden Road to existing Legacy Drive, west of Pima Road.
4. Remove the portion of Legacy Drive through the Scottsdale Water Campus from the Transportation Master Plan.
5. Extend existing Mayo Boulevard from its termination east of Scottsdale Road; southeast to intersect with Hayden Road, and to intersect with the extension of Perimeter Drive, then northeast beneath SR-101, to connect with existing Legacy Drive, west of Pima Road.
6. Extend McDowell Mountain Ranch Road, as a minor arterial, west from its current terminus at 98th Street, northwest to intersect with 94th Street.
7. Remove the portion of 128th Street through the Scottsdale Preserve in the Transportation Master Plan.
8. Indicate in the Transportation Master Plan that Scottsdale Road, from Happy Valley Road to Carefree Highway, is classified as a major arterial for right-of-way and a minor arterial for construction.
9. Indicate in the Transportation Master Plan that Pima Road, from Dynamite Boulevard to Legend Trail, is classified as a major arterial for right-of-way and a minor arterial for construction.
10. Indicate in the Transportation Master Plan that Pima Road, from Legend Trail to Stagecoach Pass, is classified as a major arterial for right-of-way and a one-motor vehicle-lane per direction for construction.

There was an oversight from the 2016 Transportation Master Plan. Lincoln Road west of Scottsdale Road was excluded. It is one-eighth of a mile west of Scottsdale Road. The

proposed recommendation rectifies the omission. The one-eighth mile should be a four-lane landscape divided minor arterial, whereas Lincoln Drive east of Scottsdale Road would stay as a one-lane per direction minor collector.

The segment at Hayden Road at SR-101 was revised by City Council action within the past two years. Nationwide is the property owner. Prior to purchasing the property from the State Lands Department, they requested rezoning of the property, which was granted by City Council. The Department requests a change in the classification of the portion of Hayden Road immediately north and south of Pima Freeway, consistent with the City Council decision. Projected 2030 daily volumes indicate 34,400 daily volume just north of the freeway and 39,300 south of the freeway. Consequently, the Department recommended to City Council and to Nationwide that this portion of Hayden Road be a six-lane street; this was included in the stipulations on the Nationwide development. The projected traffic volumes were developed by Nationwide's consulting traffic engineer, who completed a preliminary traffic impact study for the proposed rezoning.

There is a street alignment change in the same vicinity north of the Pima Freeway. In the current Transportation Master Plan, Legacy Drive traverses the Scottsdale Water Campus. The intention was to connect the two Legacy Drives through the Scottsdale Water campus. Subsequent to 2001, there is heightened awareness of arterial streets in sensitive areas, including water treatment facilities. As such, the road would have been constructed deeply depressed underground with driveway bridges. From a transportation perspective, alternative alignments are more effective. The proposed alignment shows essentially two Legacy Drives. One would connect the missing quarter mile and the other would extend Mayo Boulevard to the east before crossing under the Pima Freeway. It would be a non-interchange undercrossing of the freeway that would attract substantial through traffic volumes, reducing demand at the Pima Princess and Hayden interchanges. Perimeter Drive would still connect to Mayo Boulevard, but would be at an intersection, rather than a continuous curved street.

Commissioner referred to the segment on Mayo, noting that there are FAA buildings in the vicinity and asked how the alignment will affect them. Mr. Basha said he is not aware of such buildings. The indicated portion of the alignment does not change. The only portion that will change is that which traverses underneath the Pima Freeway. Commissioner commented that current GPS maps do indicate an FAA building in the vicinity. Mr. Basha reviewed the aerial photograph in order to identify the building. Staff will research this to determine any potential impacts.

The proposed street modification is an extension of McDowell Mountain Ranch Road to serve WestWorld. WestWorld exists primarily on Bureau of Reclamation land and straddles the Arizona Project Canal. The suggestion is that a new street be added, minor arterial, two lanes per direction with a raised landscaped median. The intention is to provide a second access into WestWorld.

The Transportation Department, Planning Department and Police Department are recommending that the segment of 128th Street right-of-way remain in the Transportation Master Plan. The portion of 118th Street is currently under construction to be completed by June. From a purely transportation perspective, the roadway segment is not needed. The land is primarily Preserve and low density residential. However, the Planning Department strongly believes that the roadway should remain, as some properties may be subject to an increase in density through future rezoning and would like to reserve the right for the street to exist. The Police Department prefers a second access to the vicinity in the future for general population

and emergency access. The Police Department also believes there should be a secondary alternative route to Dynamite Boulevard in the vicinity.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha suggested that Recommendation No. 7 be eliminated. Commissioner urged the Commission to include No. 7 and state it in the positive, to retain 128th Street, citing the following arguments:

- In the past, there has been surprise at the growth of traffic volumes throughout the City.
- It is purported that 118th Street will be able handle the volumes, however it is a mile away.
- There is potential of future new home construction in the area to the north and east.
- Pulling the street from the plan would be a disservice to current and future homeowners.
- Removing the street from the plan (even if right-of-way is maintained), makes future construction, if needed, increasingly problematic.

Mr. Basha addressed the increased right-of-way recommendation involving two dominant north/south streets north of the canal. It is recommended that a portion of Pima Road remain as two lanes, but that the City acquire right-of-way for a potential six lane roadway for the one-mile segment. The identified portions of Pima and Scottsdale Roads should be constructed to four lanes with right-of-way sufficient for a six-lane roadway.

In response to a question from Vice Chair, Mr. Basha clarified that the recommendation for Item No. 7 is that the word “remove” be changed to “retain.” The City supports this recommendation.

Chair referenced the Nationwide building on Hayden Road and the expansion from a minor to a major arterial. He asked about effects on Miller Road. Mr. Basha said Miller currently does not exist but is in the Transportation Master Plan and will be constructed. The 2030 traffic volume projections included Miller Road existence in this location.

Vice Chair asked for confirmation that neither of the traffic volumes indicate the need for a major arterial on Hayden Road. Mr. Basha said that 34,400 figure is greater than the capacity of a four-line minor arterial. The figure of 48,000 represents the capacity for a six-lane major arterial. This segment of Hayden Road between Legacy and Traffic has predicted traffic volumes for 2030 requiring a six-lane street. The predicted daily traffic volumes north of Legacy and south of Princess are less than 34,000.

In response to a question from Chair, Mr. Basha confirmed that the main objective for the WestWorld access road is to provide another outlet for the WestWorld facility. It is an easterly access to and from WestWorld, but provides travel for eastbound, northbound and southbound, with more alternatives for westbound. Chair asked whether alternatives were considered by the Department, such as coming from the south. Mr. Basha said alternatives were explored over decades, however, all were more expensive.

Chair summarized the Commission’s options:

- Accept the amendments as written, with the exception of changing the language in No. 7 from “remove” to “retain.”
- Make a motion to accept the amendments with the omission of No. 7.

Chair stated his inclination to remove No. 7, because the Commission does not make a practice of explaining why something should be kept as is. He recited all the agencies and departments that recommend retention of the street in the Transportation Master Plan. Commissioner asked if there were any departments against its inclusion. Mr. Basha said from a transportation perspective, the road is unnecessary. From a planning and police perspective, it is desired. Commissioner commented that keeping No. 7 in and modifying, places the Commission on record that they feel it should stay. Commissioner commented that it should be simply removed without comment, as no change is being made. When asked for his perspective, Mr. Basha said it would be a more positive statement to include retaining 128th Street through the Preserve, if that is the Commission's desire.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha confirmed that there was discussion in 2015 regarding eliminating 128th Street. When City Council adopted the Transportation Master Plan in 2016, they voted to retain it. Commissioner said it makes sense for the Transportation Commission to then reinforce this.

Commissioner inquired as to why the Planning Department wants to have the street. Mr. Basha stated it is because nearby properties may be rezoned in the future, such that the street becomes necessary. Discussion ensued regarding procedural issues and the history of the Commission's discussion on this topic.

Commissioner noted the dramatic changes in northern Scottsdale. The fact that the Planning Department feels there is going to need to be a road through the Preserve indicates that more change and more growth will occur. Additional traffic, development and growth is not necessarily desirable for the area. Instead, they should be working to develop ideas to limit traffic in the Preserve area. Both streets, Dynamite and 128th Street preceded the Preserve. There was discussion regarding removing No. 7 from the list, as it is not technically an amendment, to address it separately and to address the remaining list as is.

Commissioner inquired as to what portion of the Preserve the street segment represents. Mr. Basha could not provide an exact number, but noted it is a relatively small portion in terms of geographic area, however, it is a critical portion of the Preserve. The Fish & Game Department has done analysis of wildlife north and south of Dynamite and they are seeing a distinction in the genetics of the animals, based on whether they live north or south.

COMMISSIONER LALL MOVED TO REMOVE NUMBER 7 FROM THE RECOMMENDED TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN AMENDMENTS TO BE CONSIDERED SEPARATELY. COMMISSIONER KUZEL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 6-0 WITH CHAIR GRAHAM AND COMMISSIONERS ANDERSON, ERTEL, HIGGS, KUZEL AND LALL VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES. VICE CHAIR IACOVO ABSTAINED.

Vice Chair stated that the Transportation Director has asked the Commission to make a recommendation on changes to the Transportation Master Plan, not to have a discussion on an individual topic. Last month, the Commission agreed to "remove the yellow line," but maintain the right-of-way, taking the street out of the Transportation Master Plan.

COMMISSIONER LALL MOVED TO MODIFY NUMBER 7 IN THE RECOMMENDED TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN AMENDMENTS BY REPLACING "REMOVE" WITH "RETAIN." COMMISSIONER LALL AMENDED THE MOTION TO ALSO REPLACE 'FROM' WITH 'IN'. COMMISSIONER ERTEL SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 5-0 WITH VICE CHAIR IACOVO AND COMMISSIONERS ANDERSON, ERTEL, HIGGS, AND LALL

VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES. CHAIR GRAHAM AND COMMISSIONER KUZEL ABSTAINED.

6. COUNCIL CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT SUBCOMMITTEE STATUS

Mr. Basha stated that the Council Capital Improvement Subcommittee has discussed the possibility of a bond election with a maximum value of \$450 million, which would retain the current tax rate for the next ten years. It would then gradually decrease from 2029 to 2048. The Subcommittee has suggested eliminating all transportation and drainage projects. The reason for eliminating transportation projects is because voters already approved a sales tax increase in November of 2018 at one-tenth of one percent for ten years. They suggested eliminating drainage projects based on the recommendation to collect a stormwater fee. The Subcommittee wishes to include one transportation project located on Thompson Peak Parkway one and a half miles east of Pima Road at the Reata Wash locations with just one two-lane bridge. The bond election of 2000 included both bridges to have four lane crossings over the wash, however there was not enough money in the Bond 2000 election to construct the bridges.

The CIP Subcommittee is recommending to the full City Council consideration of 67 separate projects with an estimated expense of \$437 million. The Subcommittee also suggested that there be four to six public open houses prior to the City Council determination on whether there should be a bond election in November, 2019 and which projects should be included. After the hearings, the Subcommittee will have one more meeting on March 13th. There are five potential dates for City Council to determine whether there will be a bond election.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha explained that the \$437 million is an estimate of the expense for the 67 projects excluding the Thompson Peak Parkway Bridge.

Commissioner disagreed with the Subcommittee's decision to leave transportation projects out of the potential bond. Mr. Basha stated that Commissioners could provide input by attending any of the open houses, commenting online or by having the March Commission meeting include an action pertaining to the question.

Commissioner commented that if the public takes into consideration that transportation sales tax was just approved, they may defeat a bond that includes transportation projects.

Chair stated his preference to possibly include this as an action item next month. Mr. Basha said there is \$500 million in current transportation project needs. The projected revenue from the sales tax increase for ten years is \$130 million.

Based on a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha said City staff would not create a list of transportation projects to consider. They have already done so. If the Commission wishes to request the City Council to include transportation projects, it would be their specific decision. If desired, staff can provide the Commission with a list of 67 projects for the March meeting and Commissioners could insert transportation projects and delete other projects, creating a revised list for recommendation. It is notable that the \$450 million bond amount was predicated on not raising the sales tax. The Commission may also choose to recommend to the City Council that the bond amount be raised. It is also notable that the last three bond elections essentially failed. For the most recent election in 2015, there were six questions; four failed and two passed.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Basha stated that the purpose of the sales tax election was to provide the City contribution to receive \$170 million from MAG. The projects are already approved by MAG, with most scheduled for construction in 2025. The City has advised MAG that they would like to construct the transportation projects earlier than 2025 and MAG is amenable to the request.

Chair recommended the Commission consider including an action item on this at next month's meeting. Mr. Basha confirmed that it would be included.

7. NEW BUS AND TROLLEY ROUTE INITIAL EFFECTS

Lisa Johnson, Transportation Planning and Transit Operations Manager, stated that trolley and bus changes were initiated on October 22nd, 2018. All changes were done within the existing budget. The new service changes included expanding trolley service to the Mustang Transit Center and the Via Linda Senior Center while reducing redundancy among the previous transit routes and eliminating route segments with low ridership. These changes included consolidating the Camelback, Neighborhood and Miller Trolley routes into two routes, which eliminated redundancy and allowed trolley service to expand into a larger area. Prior to these changes, trolley service went only as far north as McDonald Drive. Today the trolley provides service as far north as Hayden Road and Northsight Boulevard. This extended service provided by the new Mustang Trolley includes the Via Linda Senior Center, Scottsdale Ranch Park and HonorHealth Shea. In addition to areas of coverage, the trolley now runs 20-minute frequency on all routes with the exception of the Old Town Trolley, which runs every 15 minutes. It is scheduled to make connections with the regional transit routes for rider convenience.

In terms of initial effects, only data from the first two months is available. A dip in ridership after service changes is common. There were some minor dips as well as some more significant dips. Ridership numbers are currently counted by trolley operators on trip sheets. The fluctuations varied depending on the day of the week.

Commissioner inquired as to the ability to determine how much of the drop is attributable to deleted route segments versus modified routes and schedule changes. Ms. Johnson said is early in the process to be able to provide those statistics. She anticipates returning later in the year to provide a more complete picture.

In response to a Commissioner question, Ms. Johnson stated that the effects of the route changes on elderly and handicapped individuals is best tracked via customer complaint receipts. Prior to the change, there were a number of complaints from residents living on Miller between McDowell and Murray.

Ms. Johnson reviewed the Miller and Hayden route. In November, there were 28,000 rides. In December, it dropped to nearly 17,000. As of January, it was back on an upward climb. 68th Street and Camelback is on a steady upswing. Miller, Hayden and 68th and Camelback replaced the Neighborhood route. It may take riders some time to realize that they could use the 68th and Camelback to complete their trip without starting at Miller/Hayden. The Mustang had 9,400 rides during the first month, 9,100 in December and nearly 10,000 in January. The Old Town Trolley is on an upward climb, increasing from 5,400 to 6,600.

In response to a Commissioner question, Ms. Johnson stated that the Mustang route has taken the place of the old Cactus Route.

Only two complaints were received related specifically to new service. Overall, the changes have been well received. Staff is working on a marketing plan to target residents and HOAs along the east section on Via Linda. Next steps include data collection, including ridership, customer input and on-time performance, recommended service changes (November of 2019), and bringing the Mustang Trolley into the Via Linda Senior Center. In late February, early March, City trolley vehicles will be fitted with a vehicle management system which will include automatic passenger counters.

8. PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR BUSES

Ms. Johnson reviewed uses of performance measures in the industry:

Regulatory uses: Providing required data in order to receive funding. Any agency that receives federal funding must report to the National Transit Database (NTD) annually. These reports include: Passengers per revenue hour, passengers per vehicle mile, farebox recovery ratio and cost per passenger. The Americans with Disability Act (ADA) requires reports on missed trips for complementary paratransit. Performance and operational data are a significant component of grant applications for state and federal funding. Funding levels are often dependent on an agency's level of ridership, population, or service hours.

In response to a Commissioner question, Ms. Johnson stated that the cost to collect data is not added to the cost per ride.

General agency uses: Performance measures can be used in specific operational and organizational ways. These include evaluating overall organizational, departmental, individual and past performance. These measures also help identify agency needs, passenger benefits and community benefits. Tracking these measures allows agencies to compare transit performance with similar transit systems.

Functional uses: Communications and community benefits. This information helps agencies communicate their organizational goals to the public and reveal their performance.

Service design standards: A set of performance measures to determine objectively where and how service should be allocated. The decision to add new transit service can be based upon guidelines developed with performance standards. The amount of estimated transit ridership, the number of transit attractors and generators, and the frequency and span of service can all be incorporated into performance measures.

Service Monitoring: Performance measures can monitor service quality at a specific time. Measures can determine if goals are not being met, being met, or are being exceeded. Service trends can also be ascertained through performance measures.

Economic performance: Performance measures are commonly used to assess cost effectiveness. Traditional transit measures included in economic performance include cost per passenger, farebox recovery ratio, cost per revenue hour and cost per revenue mile.

Management: Assessing functional areas other than service delivery can also be determined by performance measures. Risk management performance can be determined through a variety of accident and incident measures to compare and assess the level of safety, risk, and potential liability within a transit service. Vehicle maintenance can be assessed through performance

measurement. If preventive maintenance is inadequate, high levels of unplanned maintenance and vehicle breakdowns will occur. Negative outcomes in vehicle maintenance result in increased costs and disrupted service.

Scottsdale uses cost per passenger data to inform decisions regarding potential changes. Prior to October 22nd, 2018 cost per passenger was between \$2.20 to \$23.72. Route 56 was \$23.72 per rider. Its service in Scottsdale was eliminated. Route 514 has a high cost per rider of \$16.39, however some high cost routes need to continue for various reasons. The lower cost per ride routes help to offset the additional cost.

Commissioner suggested that the Department develop a policy to address a cost per ride ceiling threshold that would trigger an evaluation.

Ms. Johnson stated that Route 80 on Shea cost per ride was \$9.61. It was shortened for economic reasons. Route 81 on Hayden was \$7.36. Camelback was the poorest performer of the four trolleys with a \$6.13 subsidy. Now that is absorbed the western portion of the Neighborhood Trolley and still connects with Route 50, it is anticipated there will be more riders, which will drop the cost per rider.

Next steps include:

- Set performance measures
- Create goals
- At least one year of data needed
- Comparisons to similar sized properties
- Use new Vehicle Management System (VMS) for data collection

Ms. Johnson will return with an update eight months after the service changes.

9. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Mr. Basha addressed the Drinkwater Boulevard Civic Bridge. Scottsdale had requested funds from the MAG through the Arterial Lifecycle Program (ALCP). The total cost of construction is \$8.5 to \$9 million. It is requested that MAG provide 70 percent of the funding (\$6 million) this July. There is good progress moving the project through the four committees. A favorable vote is expected next week from the Regional Council. The City also requested that MAG help fund the 68th Street Bridge replacement, however MAG indicated the project did not qualify.

In response to a question from Chair, Mr. Basha stated that the project was never identified for funding via the sales tax election in November or the previous sales tax election. The \$6 million cost is in addition to the \$170 million total.

In response to question from Chair, Mr. Basha stated that he would provide an update as to the reallocation of the \$6 million funding for other projects in the coming months.

Mr. Basha provided a light rail update. The light rail line terminating in Downtown Mesa will extend to Gilbert Road by May of 2019. The Tempe Modern Streetcar is progressing well. They hope to begin service in May of 2021. The alignment is primarily on Mill Avenue and a little bit on Ash Avenue. It is one direction through the commercial area north and Ash Avenue is south. South of University, it is a two-direction track side-by-side. At the north end of Mill Avenue, it

curves east on Rio Salado Parkway, coming close to Rural Road. The next extension in the next five years would continue into the City of Mesa to serve the Cubs Spring Training Stadium.

The Regional Board of Valley Metro, which consists of elected officials, mayors and council members from the 31 member agencies, has just elected to start having study sessions prior to their monthly meetings. They are held on Thursday mornings, usually on the same dates as the Transportation Commission meetings. He encouraged Transportation Commission members to attend a session.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no comments.

11. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner reviewed that review of the bond projects has already been determined as an agenda item.

Vice Chair noted that Ms. Johnson would be returning in several months to provide an update on Trolley and bus route performance.

12. ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

13. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Ertel and seconded by Commissioner Higgs, the meeting adjourned at 8:14 p.m.

AYES: Chair Graham, Vice Chair Iacovo, Commissioners Ertel, Anderson, Higgs, Kuzel and Lall.

NAYS: None

SUBMITTED BY:

eScribers, LLC

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**